

FROM THE CONFLICT ZONE
BULLETIN OF HUMAN RIGHTS CENTER "MEMORIAL"
Chechnya 2004: "New" Methods of Anti-Terror

Hostage taking and repressive actions against relatives of alleged combatants and terrorists

For the Chechen Republic the year 2004 was of special significance for a number of reasons. Firstly, the war spilled over its borders and spread to the neighboring republics, primarily to Ingushetia, Dagestan, North Ossetia and Kabardino-Balkariya. Secondly, it was a year of qualitative change in the methods of the anti-terrorist operation. On the one hand, the process of "Chechenization" has come to its logical completion. On the other hand, in conjunction, with support and under the auspices of the Federal Center, previously individual cases of hostage-taking, destruction of property and other forms of repressive actions against family members of alleged combatants have become systematic.

If previously repressive actions against family members of alleged combatants were either instances of revenge, or attempts to extort information about the fighters from their relatives, now these methods have become *a tactic* used to exert pressure upon combatants in order to force them to surrender. Thus, the methods of the state, which for over five years now has justified its actions in the Chechen Republic by the necessity to combat terrorism, have finally concurred with the methods of terrorists.

The ensuing thematic bulletin of HRC "Memorial" aims to systematize and analyze available data on these forms of human rights abuse.

I. Hostage Taking and "Chechenization" of Conflict

One of the main justifications for the Second invasion of the Chechen Republic in 1999 used by Kremlin was the necessity to combat enforced disappearance and hostage-taking. Indeed, in the post-war period the problem of hostage-taking in Chechnya was acute: criminal groups abducted for ransom foreigners, personnel of Russian security agencies, successful businessmen, mostly local residents.

Strangely enough, the federal forces which came into the Republic to restore order, also indulged in hostage-taking. Among the most infamous methods was the use of civilians

as "live shield". A clear example of a this type of crime were the events in the village of Komsomolskoe in early March 2000, when the civilians who fled the intense fire were for 3 days kept by the military servicemen in a field between the village, where Chechen combatant groups were positioned, and the station of the federal military forces. The following four years there were a few incidents when representatives of the federal forces captured or even killed relatives of alleged combatants, destroyed or set their houses on fire. However, in 2004 the reprisals against relatives of insurgents, including hostage-taking, became significantly more frequent and systematic.

The first public threats to the families of combatants and demands to isolate them were issued by Akhmat-Hadzhi Kadyrov shortly before his death. Thus, on May 1st 2004, in Gudermes, at a funeral in the Yamadaev family Kadyrov emphasized, that relatives and even neighbors of Chechen combatants would be punished.

On June 9, Ramzan Kadyrov, the first deputy prime minister of the Chechen government, in his interview to NTV channel said:

"We will punish their relatives according to law. They help bandits, but they say that they help their relatives, their brothers and sisters. No, they help bandits. We will punish them according law. And if there is no such law, we will ask for it, we will turn to the Russian State Duma and they will pass such a law so that it becomes possible to punish. Otherwise, the war in the Chechen Republic will never end".

In continuation of this topic, on October 20th 2004 Vladimir Oustinov, the Prosecutor General of the Russian Federation, proposed to the State Duma to legalize "counter hostage-taking" and "a simplified legal proceedings" against terrorists. At first, the reaction to this initiative was that of applause. "The detention of relatives of terrorists during terrorist acts will certainly help us to safe and rescue people", the Prosecutor General said. Boris Gryzlov, the speaker of the Russian State Duma followed up on the Prosecutor's initiative and said that the Duma was ready to discuss an amendment to the existing legislation "On Combat of Terrorism": "If the given proposal is formulated as an amendment, it will be considered", -he said.

The initiative of the Prosecutor General had been widely discussed within political circles and in mass-media - and received an almost unanimously negative evaluation. The

reaction of human rights activists was predictable: for them the proposal to legalize crime, coming from a person who was supposed to monitor the respect of law, was a clear basis for his resignation. But even MPs from "Edinaja Rossija" (Ljubov Sliska), the party most loyal to the incumbent executive, and former representatives of special services (Gennady Gudkov) were likewise very critical. Thus, the initiative of Prosecutor Oustinov did not get to implementation.

In fact, the Prosecutor General suggested to legalize the methods, which had already been widely used by security agencies in Chechnya in 2004.

One of the reasons for wide bearing of collective responsibility practice in 2004, was the completion of "Chechenization" of the conflict: the routine work for carrying out of the so-called "anti-terrorist operation" in Chechnya was largely transferred to the security agencies manned by ethnic Chechens. Their major task is to eliminate combatant networks on the plain, and to force the fighters remaining in the hills to surrender to the authorities. For these purposes the Federal Center provides the local security agencies with sufficient resources, administrative and political support, and, most importantly, guarantees of impunity.

The policy of "Chechenization" allows for a number of strategic and propagandistic benefits.

First, it allows to represent the Chechen conflict not as a separatist, but as an intra-Chechen one. One of the sides is positioned as "the legitimate authority" and declared the only partner for "political settlement of the conflict" pursued by the federal center. This propaganda trick allows the Kremlin to implement its "conflict resolution" plan, which completely excludes the possibility to negotiate with the antagonist.

Second, Chechenization permits to divert the criticism of domestic human rights groups and of the international community from the Federal Center and to channel it towards the local security services. The involvement of federal military and security structures in the "anti-terrorist operation" is minimized, or at least, not emphasized. In the last two years the pro-federal Chechen security agencies have received a fair amount of criticism for human rights crimes. It is tempting to present the current developments in Chechnya not as a new wave of grave and mass human rights abuse committed by the federal side, for which the Russian Federation is to be held responsible, but as "internal sorting outs" between

Chechens. Such perception is facilitated by the federal propaganda machine, which is promoting the image of “wicked Chechen”, for whom kidnapping of people and hostage-taking is almost an organic element of traditional culture.

Consistent effort has been invested at the domestic and international levels to transfer the burden of responsibility for human rights abuse in Chechnya from federal shoulders to the local authorities. Thus, during PACE discussions of the Resolution on Chechnya in October 2004, the Russian delegation insisted on adopting an amendment, which divided responsibility for enforced disappearance and hostage taking between the federal and Chechen authorities. In the Constitution of the Chechen Republic “adopted” during the referendum of March 2004, the responsibility for protection of human rights is placed on the republican authorities.

Thirdly, “Chechenization” has tactical advantages for the federal authorities at the level of Chechnya itself. The leaders of Chechen fighters and their field commanders, eliminated by Chechen security forces are not acquiring the aura of “martyrs and freedom fighters, killed by foreign enemies”, which prevents popularization of the separatist ideology. On top of this, there emerges a new stratum of people, dependent on the Russian authorities. Blood feud is still relevant in Chechnya, acts of vengeance for killed relative will be executed even decades later, which creates “blood dependency” of the new republican security services on the federal authorities.

Pro-federal Chechen security agencies and armed formations include: the forces of Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Chechen Republic, Spetznaz Battalions “Vostok” and “Zapad”, and Security Service of the Chechen President under command of Ramzan Kadyrov. Another influential group is of Movladi Baysarov, based in the village of Pobedinskoje, north-west of Grozny.

The social composition of these formations varies. The Battalion “Zapad” under command of Said-Magomed Kakiev consists of those who in 1994 sided with the federal army. In the Battalion “Vostok” under Sulim Yamadaev are those who fought on the side of separatists in the first war, but changed sides in 1999. The most powerful security agency currently functioning in Chechnya is the Security Service of the President of the Chechen Republic, created by Akhmad-Khadzi Kadyrov, commonly referred to as “*the kadyrovtsy*”. The Security Service unites those who fought in the first and in the second war on the side of separatists, but then agreed to surrender to authorities under the personal guarantees of

Akhmad-Khadzi Kadyrov. This structure is headed by Akhmad-Khadzi's son, Ramzan Kadyrov. After assassination of Kadyrov-father this service was reorganized into the regiment of Checkpoint Guard Service of Militia (???? 2). However, until now groups of armed people, who formally do not belong to the Security Service but claim that they obey only direct orders of Ramzan Kadyrov are based in the Chechen settlements. Recently, the republican security agencies recruited young men who have previously not been involved in the conflict. In the conditions of high unemployment joining these services is about the only option for young men to have stable income.

2. Chechnya 2004: Repressions Against Family Members of Chechen Combatants as a Method of Anti-terror

In January HRC "Memorial" reported the disappearance of 7 relatives of the leader of Chechen separatists Aslan Maskhadov, including his elderly sister, two brothers, a niece, a nephew, and two distant relatives. According to eye-witnesses, at different points during December 2004 all of them were detained by personnel of Republican Security Service under command of Ramzan Kadyrov and driven in the unknown direction.

This is not the first detainment of Aslan Maskhadov's family members. Thus, Aslan's brother, Lecha Maskhadov, born 1936, was kidnapped in 2000 by the military unit of Beslan Gantemirov and illegally detained for two months. The relatives claim that he spent 26 days in Gudermes Temporary Detainment Facility (IVS) in cell N 10 and was subsequently transferred to FSB.

In the first days of September during hostage taking in the North Ossetian town of Beslan 12 relatives of Aslan Maskhadov were taken hostage: his sister Buchu and the family of his cousin. Nephew Arthur Maskhadov was kidnapped from his own wedding together with the bride. At the same time were detained the Semievs, relatives of Aslan Maskhadov's wife. On September 3, after the emergency storming of school in Beslan, all of them were released.

The consequences of the recent detainment of Maskhadov family members turned out more serious: as of March 9 2004, the whereabouts of the kidnapped remain unknown. The relatives suppose that they are detained in the village of Tsentaroi at the base of Security Service under command of Ramzan Kadyrov.

The kidnapping of Maskhadov's family members received attention of media and international organizations: PACE and other international actors expressed their concern and protest. Few people knew, however, that hostage taking of relatives of combatants as well as repressive actions against them had been widely practiced in Chechnya in 2004.

One of the few cases, which received publicity in 2004 was hostage-taking of family members of field commander, Minister of Defense of the Chechen Republic Ichkeria, Magomed Khambiev. According to various estimates, in between February 29 and March 1, 40 to 80 relatives of Khambiev family were kidnapped from different settlements of Chechnya. Mass detentions were carried out in the villages of Meskhety, Benoj, Turty-Khutor. In Grozny was kidnapped a 1st year student of Medical school of Chechen State University, Aslambek Khambiev, born 1985. According to his fellow-students, armed men in camouflage uniform detained Aslambek during a lecture and drove him in the unknown direction.

Hostages were placed in the Temporary Detainment Facility (IVS) of Nozhaj-Yurt ROVD, in the illegal detainment facilities on the bases of Ramzan Kadyrov and Sulim Yamadaev. Young men were subjected to beatings. Through intermediaries Magomed Khambiev was delivered a message with a demand to surrender immediately and "voluntary", which he subsequently did to save his relatives.

Along with hostage-taking, other punitive actions against relatives of alleged combatants were practiced in 2004. Representatives of security agencies burnt houses and destroyed property of these families. Illegal detainment and beatings of relatives and co-villagers aimed at extortion of information about combatants were widespread. In early 2004 HRC "Memorial" registered such cases almost on a monthly basis, after the infamous proposition of the Prosecutor General on October 20, almost weekly.

Of special concern is the increase of crimes against women. In 2004 they acquired a mass character. Most frequently among kidnapped and hostages were mothers, wives and sisters of combatants. For Chechen men inability to protect their women and elders is a strong blow on dignity. Hostage taking of combatant family members is not only morally wrong in itself, but it is counterproductive, since it strengthens the motivation of combatants to continue the guerilla war by urge for revenge. "This is not the end. They think they are masters here, because they have guns and power. Wait until it gets warmer. They also have relatives..." said one of the women who had been hostage.

Indeed, the new methods of anti-terror intensify confrontation, complicating the by now catastrophic security conditions in Chechnya. Already in spring 2004 “Memorial” registered punitive actions against Kadyrov people, committed by Chechen fighters.

On April 12, 2004 at about 8 p.m. a big group of armed men entered the village of Ishkhoi-Yurt, Gudermes district of Chechnya. They had lists of villagers, who worked for the security forces. Within several hours they killed seven militiamen and representatives of Kadyrov Security Service. The fighters burnt the house of Dimaev family (their son works for Security Service), subjected to fire the houses of Dzabrailovs (their cousin is a local militiaman), house of Saaevs (son works for traffic police), house of Abdulkadyrovs (son works for Security Service). The fighters intended to burn all these houses, and the houses of some other villagers, employed by law enforcement agencies, but the relatives asked them not to do so, and promised that their men would give up these jobs. The fighters repeatedly told local residents that after Kadyrov people started to take hostage their women and children they were not going to limit their actions by any moral norms.

At night on May 1 after a short fight the village of *Alleroj, Kurchaloy district of Chechnya* was invaded by fighters of Akhmed Avdarkhanov group. The combatants headed towards the house of Abuev family, whose son Suleiman worked for Kadyrov Security Service. Suleiman was not at home and the fighters kidnapped Yusup Abuev, aged 22, Abukar Abuev aged 27, and Isa Ousmaev, aged 26, the neighbor of Abuev family. The relatives of the hostages were told that the young men were being kidnapped in retaliation for the murder of Ruslan Dalkhanov, who had been earlier kidnapped from his house by “kadyrovtsy” under command of Suleiman Abuev. Dalkhanov was tortured to death.

On November 9, in the proximity of the village of Alleroj was found a grave, which contained the dead bodies of the three men, kidnapped by the Chechen fighters on May 1. Probably, these people were killed soon after the kidnapping.

Such cases show vividly that the new methods of anti-terror intensify internal struggle and create serious preconditions for civil war in Chechnya.

The appendix contains selected cases of the above analyzed human rights violations. The security agency, which carried out the operation is indicated as stated by the eye-witnesses or relatives.

Appendix

Selected Cases of Kidnappings, Murder, Hostage-Taking, Illegal Detainment, Beatings and Destruction of Property of Relatives of Alleged Combatants and Terrorists

On January 19, at 1.40 a.m. more than 20 representatives of Russian power agencies arrived at the house of **Mutaev family**, temporary residing in village *Assinovskaya Sunzhensky district of Chechnya*, domicile address: *Bershanskaia street, 60*. They aimed to detain two young women -**Luiza Mutaeva**, born 1984, and **Madina Mutaeva**, born 1988. Eventually they detained only the older sister and drove her into unknown direction.

Luiza Mutaeva is the sister of **Malidzi Mutaeva**, born 1971, who was allegedly a member of Theater Terror in Moscow of October 2002. After the terrorist act, on December 4, 2002 at about 6 a.m. the Russian military servicemen blew up the house of Mutaev family, located in the village of Assinovskaia, domicile address: *D. Bednogo street 12*. On January 20, 2003, was kidnapped Malidzi's brother-**Isa Mutaev**. Subsequently he "disappeared".

On March 23 the representatives of federal power agency (reportedly FSB) kidnapped **Mintsaeva Yakha**, 60 years old, from her house in *Oktyabr'sky district of Grozny*.

On March 25 women - trade vendors who worked as at the Central Market together with Yakha protested in front of government building and demanded that the republican authorities released the elderly lady. On March 26, Yakha Mintsaeva was released.

One year before the described events, the son of Yakha Mintsaeva was detained and brought to the Russian military base in Khankala. Some time later the military servicemen tried to detain her second son, but Yakha bribed him out. Subsequently, Yakha managed to buy her first son's release. Yakha sent both of her sons to live with their relatives in Russia. Probably, these events caused Yakha's detainment.

On March 28, in the village of *Sleptsovsk Sunzhensky district of the Republic of Ingushetia* a group of armed men broke into the house of **Gelagaev** family.

At the moment of the assault the head of the family, Alkhazur Gelagaev, was not at home. Armed men, who spoke Chechen and Russian languages demanded that Alkhazur's wife

Iman Khaletova, told them the address of her husband's brother Taus Gelagaev. When the woman said that she knew nothing about the whereabouts of her brother-in-law, the military men threw her on the floor, kicked her with boots, and then threatening to kill her took out a knife and cut skin on her forehead and chest. Having grasped the baby their put the knife to his throat and told Iman that they would cut if she doesn't tell them where Gelagaev was. Torture was stopped by one of the men, who said in Russian "No victims here!". Then the unidentified servicemen left.

In the end of March in the village of Alleroj the personnel of Chechen security agencies detained **Zhabrailov Khizir**, born 1980 and **Zhabrailov Ali**, born 1979.

It was the second detainment of the young men by Chechen security forces. On November 4, 2003 they were detained from their house and kept as hostages for over a month, in hope that their brother, a participant of Chechen armed formations, surrenders to the authorities. In the place of detainment Ali and Khizir Zhabrailov were beaten. The brothers were released under condition that they bring their fighting brother to the authorities.

On August 10, 2004 Zhabrailov men were detained again, this time the father, **Zabrailov Amandy**, born 1950, and his son **Zhabrailov Ali**, born 1979. They were released the following day, on August 11. The family was prosecuted because one of their relatives Khadzi Zhabrailov participated in the armed formations of the Chechen Republic Ichkeria.

Presently, Zhabrailovs are left in peace, because Khadzi has been killed and one of Amandy's sons joined '*the kadyrovtsy*' and was even promoted to commander of a military unit.

On April 18, in the Republic of Ingushetia was kidnapped **Aminat (Amant) Soslambekova**, 23 years old, a resident of Chechnya. Every day Aminat was visiting the hospital where her paralyzed brother was undergoing treatment in a separate ward under guard by representatives of local law enforcement agencies. On April 18, Aminat Soslambekova as usual went to the hospital and did not return back.

The year before the described events the brother of Soslambekova was heavily injured in cross fire with the militiamen, which resulted in his paralysis. The same year he was sentenced to 4 years in prison, according to article 209 (Banditism) and 105 (Murder) of

the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation.

On May 3, 2004 Aminat Soslambekova was released. Before release the woman was warned that she should not tell anybody of what happened to her. According to the neighbors, for a long time after her release Soslambekova refused to talk even to her family members. Subsequently, it became known that Aminat was kept in an isolated dark room with plastered walls and iron bed. Bread and water was given to her on the third day only. She was interrogated: asked for the names of fighters, vakhabites, for their addresses and whereabouts. She was warned to tell everything she knew lest she should want to become “disappeared without trace”.

On May 2, a mop up operation was carried out in the *village of Noibera, Gudermes region of Chechnya*. Regional military structures and ‘kadyrovtsy’ were called in to take part in this action.

During the course of this special operation **Veziyev Maskhud (Pakhrudi)**, aged 50 and resident in Zhukova Street, was detained by “kadyrovtsy” and taken away to an unknown destination. The accusation was made against Pakhrudi that his son was a member of the Chechen armed resistance. Maskhud spent a week at ‘the kadyrovtsy’ base. In a week he was released under condition that he brings his son Gapur. Maskhud did not bring his son.

On November 27, ‘kadyrovtsy’ got on the track of Gapur and tried to detain him at a wedding of his relative. In the course of the detainment Gapur and his uncle Salam were heavily injured; both subsequently died of the received injuries.

On May 2, in *Alleroi village of Kurchaloevski district of Chechnya*, in response to operation carried out by the combatant group of Akhmed Avdarkhanov, ‘the kadyrovtsy’ carried out a public punitive raid.

Kadyrov’s men set fire to the house of **Said-Hasan Turlaev**, whose son, according to villagers, belonged to the group of field commander Ahmed Avdarhanov. For a considerable time the members of Security Services of President refused to allow Said-Hasan’s 22-year-old daughter to leave the burning house. Only the intervention of the neighbours saved the girl’s life. The **Buzurkaev** family’s house was also burnt. Their son belongs to the ranks of the armed troops of the Chechen Republic Ichkeria.

'Kadyrovtsy' detained many local inhabitants, including school-age boys. Some were released after questioning, but 9 people, all relatives of members of the combatant groups were taken hostage: **Sheikh-Akhmed Buzurkaev**, aged 50, **Ramzan Avdarkhanov**, aged 70, **Ahmed Avdarkhanov**, **Aslan Butzugov**, aged 25, **Arsen Minkailov**, aged 24, **Isa El'siev**, aged 32, and **3 members of the Aisultanov family**.

Ramzan Avdarkhanov was seriously ill and was released on the first day, as 'kadyrovtsy' were afraid he might die, however, was soon taken in again. Arsen Minkailov was released on 3 May, Aslan and Alikhan Butsugov on 4 May; Isa El'siev and Ramzan Avdarkhanov on 6 May and Sheikh-Akhmed Buzurkaev and Nasurov Vakhid (schoolboy, the brother of fighter Nasurov) were released a month later, on 2 June.

On August 10, from the Ajsultanov family men were kidnapped again: Takhir Ajsultanov, aged 23 and Alikhan Ajsultanov. They are relatives of Nurzhan Ajsultanova, detained in March 2004 and accused of cooperation with Aslan Maskhadov. A few days later brothers Ajsultanov were released. Nurzhan Ajsultanova remained in Tsentaroj prison until June 2004.

On May 4, in the *village of Alleroi, Kurchaloevski region*, personnel of Kurchaloy ROVD detained and placed in a Temporary Residence Facility (IVS) a local woman, **Taus Buzurkaeva** (born 1959). She was accused of being the mother of a member of the illegal armed formations. On 2 May 2004 her house was burnt down by members of Kadyrov Security Services. Buzurkaeva was released on May 7 or 8.

At night of June 2 in the *village of Starye Atagi, Groznensky (Selsky) district of Chechnya* armed men, dressed in the camouflage uniform, some of whom were wearing masks, broke into the house of **Khamzatov family**, residents of *Podgornaya* street. Subsequently, it turned out that they were the military servicemen based on the territory of former flour-mill at the outskirts of the village. According to the neighbors, the military servicemen arrived by APCs, an YAZ car, a white "Niva" car and a white mini-bus "Gazel". None of the cars had registration numbers.

They seized the head of the family **Khasan Khamzatov**, born 1950, and started to beat him, demanding that he revealed the whereabouts of his son. Khamzatov tried to explain that his son had lived in Germany since 2000 and begged the military servicemen not to beat him since he had just had an operation for extraction of hernia.

But the requests of the old man did not stop the military servicemen: Khamzatov's rib was broken and one of his eyes seriously hurt. Khasan's wife was kept in a corner, with guns targeted at her, she was verbally abused. The oldest son with his wife and children were closed in another house.

Simultaneously an unsanctioned search had been carried out: within three hours the military servicemen turned everything in the house upside down, but found nothing that would interest them. Afterwards they left the house, got on cars and the convoy entered the territory of the military base.

On June 24 in the village of Samashki, Achkhoi-Martanovsky district, allegedly the personnel of FSB kidnapped and drove into unknown direction a local resident, **Abdul Khalit Dzabrailov**, born 1957.

The kidnapers were wearing masks and camouflage uniform, they spoke unaccented Russian. The relatives think that he was taken because of his 18 year old nephew, the participant of Chechen armed formations, who lost his relatives in early childhood and was brought up in the house of his uncle. In the last two years personnel of Russian security agencies paid several visits to the Dzabrailov house.

For a long time the whereabouts of the kidnapped remained unknown. However, in the end of summer Ruslan Dzabrailov got into ambush in the center of village and was killed. The military servicemen took his corpse with him. Soon intermediaries arrived to the house of Dzabrailov and offered the family to buy two corpses of Abdul Khalit Dzabrailov and his nephew, for 10,000 USD,

At night in June 25 masked 'kadyrovtsy' broke into the house N 243, located in the town of Gudermes, Krasnoarmejskaja street. They dragged **Makhmut Dzabrailov**, born 1952, his wife **Marzhan**, born 1959, and their sons **Ali**, born 1983 and **Magomed**, born 1986 out of their beds, forced them out of the house, and in their cars.

According to the information at the disposal of "Memorial", one of the Dzabrailovs is a participant of Chechen armed formations, therefore his relatives have been regularly detained. Earlier 'kadyrovtsy' kept hostage two other brothers of the combatant.

On June 31, prisoners, released from the illegal detainment facility in Tsentaroy told the

Dzabrailovs that their relatives were kept there.

Later it turned out that a few days before Makhmut, Marzhan, Ali and Magomed were seized another member of Dzabrailov family, Musa, aged 41, was kidnapped from Gudermes. After the detainment Musa Dzabrailov was brought to the same illegal prison and subjected to severe torture. He was shot in his leg and then interrogated under torture. After 10 days of detainment he was placed into the surgery department of Gudermes hospital N 2. His treatment continued for three weeks. As soon as Musa was able to move on his own he was again taken in to Tsentaroy. After that on August 31, the rest of Dzabrailovs were released.

On September 30, 2004 at the northern outskirts of *Zhalargy village* (300 meters from civilian houses) was found a corpse, wrapped in a blanket. He was identified as Musa Dzabrailov. Although there were two bullets in his body from TT pistol and two from Kalashnikov machine gun, caliber 5,45 mm, most likely Musa died of beatings and torture. The bones on his hands and legs were crushed, his skull was broken with a heavy object.

At night on July 30, at about 2 a.m. armed 'kadyrovtsy' broke into the house of **Kagermanov family**, residents of *Chaikina Street, in the city of Gudermes*. They woke up 55 year old **Adam Kagermanov** and having placed him in their car drove in the unknown direction. The relatives were told by "Kadyrovtsy" that he would only be released if Adam's son, Aslan Kagermanov came to pick him up. On the night of the detainment Aslan was not at home.

On July 21 people, released from Tsentaroy prison told the family that Adam Kagermanov was illegally detained on the territory of this prison.

On July 31, in the village of *Dzalka, Gudermes district of Chechnya* disappeared **Dukvakha Musalaev**, 30 years old. He went to a funeral and did not return back. On August 1, the motobike of Dukvakha was found 300 meters away from his house. After some time it turned out that the man was detained by the representatives of local Security Service.

Dukvakha was detained for being a brother of suicide bomber, **Larisa Musalaeva**, who attempted to kill Akhmad Kadyrov on May 14, 2003 in the village of Ilaskhan-Yurt. Another family member-Imran Musalaev, born 1974, blew himself up by activating a grenade. In

2003 'kadyrovtsy' kidnapped yet another Musalaev - Magomed, who subsequently disappeared.

According to the villagers, Dukhvakha did not keep contact with his sister or brothers. Two days after Dukhvakha's disappearance his mother Zargan Musalaeva was kidnapped. Dukhvakha was released one month later. His mother was also released.

On August 2, in *Mikenskaya village, Naursky district of Chechnya*, unidentified persons in camouflage uniform speaking Chechen kidnapped **Magomadova Zaira**, born 1981, a resident of *Shkolnaya street 26*.

According to the mother of the kidnapped, **Magomadova Rakiyat**, unidentified persons arrived at their house by four Niva cars of white color. They broke into the yard and grasped Zaira, who was whitewashing the house. The military servicemen behaved rudely, they swore and threatened the family with guns. The brother of Zaira said that his sister was not going anywhere without him. Rakiyat started screaming, called for help, tried to persuade the unidentified persons to tell her where they were taking her children. The military servicemen explained that they were the personnel of the republican security service - 'kadyrovtsy', that her daughter was taken to Khose-Yurt (Tsentaroy) and promised to release her the following day. After that the military servicemen left, having dropped Zaira's brother out of their car.

At the crossroad of Naurskaya - Mikenskaya - Chernokozovo the militiamen from Naursky OVD tried to stop the kidnapers. However, to avoid armed clashes the militiamen had to let them go.

On August 4, Magomadova Rakiyat turned to the Grozny office of "Memorial". She suspected that the kidnapping of her daughter was related to the murder of Zaira's husband, who was killed by the representatives of federal and Ingush security agencies in May 2004 in Nazran.

On August 26, the personnel of local security agencies kidnapped *Ramzan Avdarkhanov, Malkan Ajsultanova and Bukhari Nasurov*, residents of the village of Alleroj, Kurchaloy district of Chechnya,

The woman was released 24 hours later. Two days later Bukhari Nasurov was dropped at

the outskirts of the village with his eyes blindfolded. Ramzan Avdarkhanov was also released. According to the local residents, Ramzan Advarkhanov is the uncle of Akhmed Avdarkhanov, one of the field commanders of Chechen combatants. He and his nephew had been previously several times detained by the representatives of the Russian security services.

On September 2, at the checkpoint between *Urus-Martan and Martan-Chu* was detained **Zura Shamsudinova**, born 1929.

The detainment was carried out by the personnel of FSB. They brought Shamsudinova first to the military commandant in the regional center Urus-Martan, then home, where she was allowed to take bags with groceries with her. The relatives of Shamsudinova were told that she would remain in the military commandant office and that they could bring her food.

The detained woman was brought to the FSB of Urus-Martan district and placed in a cell at the third floor of the military commandant office. According to Shamsudinova, she was treated properly.

The representatives of FSB told Zura that she was detained because of the hostage-taking in Beslan. The representatives of security services thought that Zura's son, Albek Bugaev was among the terrorists inside the school. Zura claimed that she had not seen her son for over 1,5 years after the spokesman for Regional Operations Headquarters, **I. Shabalkin**, declared that he was killed during special operation carried out by federal troops. Shamsudinova asked to release her and promised that she would stay at home and come upon the first call of authorities. The representatives of FSB refused, however, and emphasized that they should be ready at any moment to go to Beslan if such an order arrives.

On September 6, Zura Shamsudinova was released. The representatives of FSB apologized and informed her that her son was not among the terrorists in the school.

Note: On January 2002 in the center of Urus-Martan unidentified armed men, who arrived by car YAZ 2106 of white color, shot dead another son of Zura Shamsudinova, Al'vi Bugaev, born 1963. This happened a few moments after he was released from the Temporary Detainment Facility (IVS) of Temporary Department of Ministry of Interior (VOVD), where he had been detained from December 27, 2001. The third son of Zura Shamsudinova, born 1960, disappeared without trace after detainment by representatives

of security forces on January 23, 2003 in the village of Chernorech'e, Zavodskoj district of Grozny.

On September 3 at about 4 a.m. in the village *Troitskaya, Sunzhensky district of Ingushetia* unidentified representatives of federal power agencies in masks kidnapped and drove into unknown direction members of Masuev family: **Masuev Turko**, born 1931, his wife, **Masueva Zama**, born 1944, their daughters: **Kulsum**, 1969, **Petman**, 1972, **Khavu**, 1976 and their younger son **Badrudi**, 1978. The servicemen arrived at dawn by two armed personnel carriers (one of them had registration number 041), by two trucks "Ural" and two "Niva" cars.

Later it turned out that Masuevs were brought to the military base at Khankala, where they were detained together with the relatives of Aslan Maskhadov, Doku Oumarov and other leaders of Chechen resistance. The reason for the detainment of Masuevs was their distant kin ties to the field commander Doku Oumarov. After some time the family was released.

On October 1 in the village of *Verkhnij Noybera*, the forces of Checkpoint Guard Service named after Akhmad Kadyrov carried out an operation for detainment of father and two brothers **Arzumaev**, suspected of participation in combatant groups. The suspects themselves were not at home, but their relatives and neighbors were taken, totally 8 persons, including a 13 year old boy Lechi Arzumaev. All of them were brought to the village of Tsentaroy, Kurchaloy district of Chechnya. Soon the hostages were released, but the boy was kept for a week. He was not abused physically.

Two brothers Arzumaev, Umar-Khadzi, born 1976 and Umar-Solta were again detained in January 2005. After his brothers were detained **Lechi Arzumaev**, born 1967 surrendered to 'kadyrovtsy', however, as of 22.02.05 his brothers remained detained.

In early November in the village of *Sogunty, Nozhaj-Yurt district of Chechnya*, the personnel of the Kadyrov Security Services detained relatives of **Makharbi Temiraliev**, who between two Chechen wars worked in the *sharia* court in Nozhaj-Yurt. **Oumar Temiraliev**, aged 50, **Khas-Magomed Temiraliev**, aged 54 (school teacher), and his 20 year old son remained hostages at one of the "kadyrovtsy bases" for a month. A month later Temiralievs were released.

On November 14, in the village *Alleroj*, *Kurchaloy district of Chechnya*, the personnel of Kadyrov security service kidnapped **Nasurov Khasmagomed**, two of his sons, and **Maskhadov Ramzan**. They were detained because of is the third brother **Valid Nasurov**, a Chechen fighter.

On November 26, the father and the sons Nasurov were released. They were brought home by Abuev Sulejman, the commander of *Alleroj unit of Kadyrov Security Service*. One of Nasurov's sons was heavily beaten. Now two of Nasurov brothers filed application to join Kadyrov Security Services. Ramzan Maskhadov has not returned. As of March 8 2005, his whereabouts remain unknown.

At night of November 16, at about 3 p.m. unidentified servicemen of OMON (allegedly *Sunzensky OMON*, which functions in conjunction with *Sunzensky ROVD*) broke into the house of **Umarov Amkhad**, born 1970, domicile address: *village of Sernovodsk ulitsa Nagi Asueva,5*.

Umarov is a farmer, currently he lives alone. 6 OMON fighters broke into his home at night, woke Umarov up and started beating him and demanding that he turned in his machine gun and other weaponry. They also demanded to reveal the whereabouts of his brother-in-law, Khachukaev Khizir, a field commander, general of Ichkerian army, the former commander of the famous Galanchozhsky guard (Khachukaev is married to Umarov's sister). Having beaten Umarov until he was half dead the OMON fighters left.

On November 16 at about 9 p.m. unidentified armed people broke into the house of **Soltaev** family, *residents of Kirova street, the village of Ojskara Gudermes district of Chechnya*. Without presenting their identity and without presenting any documents, they searched the house, and detained **Rizvan Akimovich Soltaev**, born 1942, the office manager of local administration and his son, **Abdullakhi Soltaev**, born 1978.

According to their co-villagers, the kidnapped father and son did not participate in the armed actions against the federal army. They were taken hostages for their nephew, Ruslan Akhmadov, a participant of Chechen armed formations, during Maskhadov time the director of Medical equipment factory in Gudermes. As it turned out later, after the kidnapping Soltaevs were brought to the illegal prison in Tsentaroy. They spent two weeks in Tsentaroy and were released after Ruslan Akhmadov was caught.

On November 27 early morning in the village *Mesker-Yurt, Shalinsky district* the personnel of one of the republican security agencies broke into the house of **Ekiev Sup'yan** and kidnapped him. Before kidnapping they carried out an unsanctioned search in his house, using rough force in respect of Ekiev. In the evening of the same day from the house of Ekiev was kidnapped his mother **Jisma** and his wife **Petmat**, born 1982. 4 small girls, including a breast-fed baby were left alone without their mother or grandmother.

From conversations with the locals, "Memorial" found out the reason for hostage taking of the Ekiev family. The day before, on November 26, in the neighboring *village of Germenchuk* unidentified persons driving Zhiguli car (VAZ 21099) killed two local militiamen and disappeared. Soon the car was found at the outskirts of Mesker-Yurt. This car for some time belonged to Eliev Sup'yan but, according to the relatives, he had sold it a long time ago. All the villages characterized Ekiev in very positive terms. For some time he worked as a deputy commander of Kadyrov security service, based in Mesker-Yurt.

On December 2 2004 at the outskirts of Grozny was found the corpse of Ekiev Sup'yan, heavily distorted by torture. His mother and wife were released 15 days later.

On November 27, in the village of Mesker-Yurt, the personnel of unidentified power agency kidnapped **Israilov Sherpuddi**, born 1956, and his wife. The wife was released a few hours later. Most likely Sherpuddi was taken hostage because his son Alikhan, who for some time worked in the security service, left this job and disappeared from the village. Reportedly, the father was taken in order to force his son to surrender. As of January 10, 2005 Sherpuddi Israilov remained in the Tsentaroy prison.

On December 1, after 9 p.m. the personnel of Kadyrov security service burnt down the house of **Murdashev Vakhid**, 1955, located at *Sovietskaya street* and the house of his parents, located at *Marksa street 'Kadyrovtsy'* brought a team of firemen along with them, in case the neighboring houses were to be set on fire. As "a sign of generosity", they left the animal shed for the family as a shelter. The elderly mother of Murdaeshev, his wife and sister were taken hostage.

In 1997-1999 Murdashev Vakhid headed the State department for cadres in Maskhadov administration. During the first Chechen campaign he joined the armed forces of separatists and was a field commander.

Some time before the above described incident in his interview to Chechen TV Ramzan Kadyrov said that he had received a video recording, with a speech of Maskhadov. In this speech Maskhadov allegedly ordered to kill Ramzan's father, Akhmad Kadyrov. Murdashev was standing next to Maskhadov and nodded in support. Kadyrov announced unlimited financial reward for capture of Maskhadov and threatened Murdashev with reprisals.

On December 23 in the *village Ojskhara* the personnel of Kadyrov security service broke into the house of **Turlaev Yunus** (aged 75), resident of *Nagornaja street*. They ousted Yunus, his wife Mandat (70 years old), his daughter and four small grand children out of the house and set it on fire. They allowed to take only documents. The house and the belongings burnt down fully.

A week before this incident there were several assaults on Turlaev family. In the village of *Tsentaroi*, they burnt the house of **Nasurhanov Musrail**, who was married to the second daughter of Turlaev, Leila. Musrail and his two sons **Nasurkhanov Khizir and Khas-Magomed** were kidnapped. In Grozny was kidnapped the oldest son of Leila Turlaeva, and in the village of *Verkhnyaja Noybera* was kidnapped a son-in-law of Yunus Turlaev, **Magomedov Nazir**, aged 45 (the husband of Yunus's third daughter, Markha). Turlaevs were released in February 2005. Turlaev family is prosecuted because of their son's participation in armed formations.